Wellbeing, International Development and Global Poverty: Of Wicked Problems and Messy Concepts

David Hulme

www.manchester.ac.uk/bwpi
www.manchester.ac.uk/idpm
www.effective-states.org
Introduction

• A way for me to get up to speed on wellbeing and development debates...reducing my ignorance

• Wellbeing and development – not a ‘required’ concept...dictionaries/handbooks of social thought, economics, politics, sociology & DS = 0

• Google it to measure comparative marginality
  - Wellbeing = 15,700,000
  - Well-being = 2,430,000,000

• Health, weight, diet, exercise...NHS, ONS & WeD
Today

• A set of thoughts about how ‘wellbeing’ relates to contemporary contests about future int’nl development goals/measures. Conceptual and political contests that are increasingly shaped by the media.

• ‘Wellbeing is a state of being with others, where human needs are met, where one can act meaningfully to pursue ones goals, and where one enjoys a satisfactory quality of life’ (WeD 2007)
Wellbeing in 2011

Figure 3: An integrated model of personal wellbeing

The intuitive appeal of wellbeing

• Intuitively, one could expect the concept of wellbeing to have traction in policy/practice
• It’s positive - about the ‘good life’ not what’s bad
• Myself, my kids...my sister’s ’best interest’
• Conversations with low income/poor people over 40 years – integrated ‘strategies’ for reduced vulnerability and personal/children’s wellbeing...not having contacts, relationship breakdown, feeling under-valued or despised
Why is wellbeing a marginal concept for international development 1?

- It’s not been (cannot be?) used as a ‘results’ measuring device (for policymakers)
- It does not sum up ‘what’s happening’ in a single number
- It’s not $1.25-a-day poverty or happiness scores...both of which are highly imperfect but provide an illusion of control and predictability!
Why is wellbeing a marginal concept for international development 2?

- It’s not managed to establish itself as a normative framework for understanding that supports broader goal-setting processes
- Capabilities, converted into human development - supported by HDI and with an intellectual icon (Sen) dominates...MDGs and post-2015
- Human rights is the ‘other’ framework that is in play
Why is wellbeing a marginal concept for international development 3?

• International political economy of knowledge creation: rich world agenda of Millennium needed poverty/deprivation - saving lives, feeding the hungry, reversing HIV/AIDS...’us’ not ‘them’ of foreign aid programming.

• Aid agencies/OECD pursued the IDGs and settled for the MDGs

• Human development was available for conversion into multidimensional poverty reduction – MDGs ‘human development meets results-based management’
### Dimensions of Development: Wellbeing Contrasted with Global Poverty/Development Frameworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Wellbeing</th>
<th>$1.25 a day</th>
<th>MPI</th>
<th>UN MDGs</th>
<th>UN HLP</th>
<th>SDGs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access to Resources</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation or Agency</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Connections</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td></td>
<td>🗝️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close Relationships</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td></td>
<td>🗝️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical and Mental Wellbeing</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Worth</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td></td>
<td>🗝️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace of Spirit</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td></td>
<td>🗝️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Sustainability</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>🗝️</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>Global partnership</td>
<td>Good governance, Employment</td>
<td>Global governance transformation, employment, biome sustainability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Health and Wellbeing at all ages
From $1.25 a day to MPI

• From a wellbeing perspective the MPI is only a very partial advance in conceptual breadth compared to income poverty.
• Does this reflect the limits to such measures or is the multidimensional measurement still up for grabs internationally?
Wellbeing, MDGs, HLP and SDGs

• A mix of contrasts reflecting the micro (bottom up) starting point of wellbeing and the macro (top down) focus of the MDGs and post-2015 development agenda

• Participation, social connections, close relationships, mental wellbeing, self-worth and peace of spirit not included in post-2015

• Wellbeing ‘fails’, at least explicitly, to cover environmental sustainability, education and global governance (international social relations)
Are these contrasts a surprise?

• No – the global focus of MDGs and post-2015 agenda (HLP and SDGs) contrasted with the micro focus of wellbeing explain much of the difference

• ...alongside the IPE of global goal setting

• So, where does that leave wellbeing...has it any comparative advantage?
Conclusion – future applications for the concept of wellbeing

I see potential advantages in pursuing wellbeing as a concept for international development

1. For projects/programmes - permits citizen participation in fine-grained approaches for local development – MDGs, HLP and SDGS useless!

2. Opening up space for ‘embedded’ civil society – professionalism of post-2015 and SDGs cf MDGs

3. To contribute conceptual counterbalances to the ‘science’ of poverty reduction – the benefits of diversity of views over ‘optimality’
Conclusion

4. It could be focussed on national goal setting and progress monitoring – the post-2015 agenda may not (will not) create a good framework for national goal-setting.

5. Helping the post 2015 agenda avoid the MDG problem of national goal imposition: wellbeing as the conceptual starting point for national deliberations (as in UK) on post-2015?